

Meeting: Port Botany Community Consultative Committee – Meeting No. 24

Held: Tuesday 6 August 2019, 5.30pm-7.30pm
McNevin Room, Prince Henry Centre – 2 Coast Hospital Rd, Little Bay

Present:

Charles Abela (CA) – Community	Marie Gibbs (MG) – Patrick Stevedores
John Burgess (JB) – Community	Peter Fielder (PeF) – Patrick Stevedores
Marcus Dwyer (MD) – Botany Bay Business Enterprise Centre	Neville Johnstone (NJ) – DP World
Patrick Medway (PM) – Bayside Chamber of Commerce	Umair Savul (US) – DP World
Bronwyn Englaro (BE) – Randwick Council	Michael Kinnell (MK) – Origin
Dylan Parker (DP) – Electorate Offices for Member for Maroubra	Ralf Genuttis (RG) – Vopak
Leigh Heaney (LH) – Electorate Offices for Member for Kingsford Smith	Alan Chambers (Ach) – Vopak
Erin Barker (EB) – EPA	Lyndon Reeves – Elgas Limited
Ingrid Emergy (IE) – Port Authority of NSW	Gary McKay (GM) – Caltex
Roberta Ryan (RR) – Chairperson	Jos Kusters (JK) – Caltex
Sandra Spate (SS) – Minute taker	Jennifer Stevenson (JS) – Hutchison
Stella Cimarosti (SC) – Minute taker	Rory Grieves (RS) – Hutchison
	Karen Jones – Orora
	Trevor Brown (TB) – NSW Ports
	Jonathan Lafforgue (JL) – NSW Ports
	Natalia McGregor (NM) – NSW Ports
	Adriane Whiley (AWH) – NSW Ports

Apologies: Aldo Costabile – Elgas, Peter Fagan – Community, Ryan Bennett – Port Authority of NSW, Catherine Blaine – Port Authority of NSW, Lynda Newnam, Paul Pickering – Community, Lachlan McGrath – Electorate Offices for Member for Kingsford Smith, Greg Walls – NSW Ports, Jamil Kharoude – Vopak, Clare Harley – Bayside Council

Item	Description	Action/Responsibility
1	Apologies and Introductions Noted apologies as above.	
2	Presentation – to introduce the community to Patrick’s Port Botany Rail Project (aka Sydney AutoStrad Botany Rail Expansion i.e. SABRE)	
2.1	Presentation attached to minutes. Key points: Construction to start shortly. Presently carrying out environmental assessments. Construction hours will include: Monday – Friday 7am-5pm Saturday 7am -3pm.	
2.2	Questions following Patrick’s presentation JB - will the length of the trains be shortened? PeF - Trains will be shortened to make them more efficient. Trains will be 600metres long. Long trains are currently split between the three	

<p>terminals. These will have a single arrival and a single departure point. PeF - Civil works are about to start in Botany. Cranes will arrive in mid-February – March. Cranes are being manufactured in China. Automation of the cranes being manufactured in Europe. Control system is being manufactured by Patrick. Cranes will be operational by the end of the third quarter of next year. About two years of work on the roads following this with a 2023 completion date.</p> <p>JB – Will duplication of the line go all the way to Moorebank? PeF – Yes. JL – most of the line is duplicated with only one section around Mascot to still be done.</p> <p>JB – I read somewhere that this was costing \$300 million. Where is the 300m coming from and how is the remainder, after the Patricks component of the project, to be spent?</p> <p>PeF – \$124 million is being invested by NSW Ports and \$70 million from Patrick. Similar deals are being offered to other terminal operators who will continue to use the existing rail line for now. JL - This is phase one in the upgrade process.</p> <p>JB – As I understand it the percentage of transport by rail has dropped from around 20% to 17%? The carrot and stick approach hasn't worked. JL – The percentage of modal share has dropped largely due to a significant drought as it's driven by rural export. Import growth has grown faster than regional export growth. The actual volume of rail has grown it just hasn't kept pace with the amount of import growth.</p> <p>JB is concerned the 40% rail target by 2020 as part of the original agreement for the port expansion and the maximum 3.2 mill TEU capacity changed with the sale of the port. The most recent target by government was 28% by 2021. At 17.7% we are 10% short of that with around a year to go. It needs to be asked whether the government will reset that target or take punitive action. TB – That is the NSW Government's target. NSW Ports has set a target of 3m TEU on rail by 2045. JL – We have seen organic rail growth up to now but terminals are at capacity. Moorebank will be on line next year. There are stepped changes. Everything going to Moorebank was by road but will now be by rail.</p> <p>MD - Does Patrick raise the funds from the public? PeF – Patrick's is a private company owned by Qube and Brookfield. No public funds have been raised for this project by Patrick.</p> <p>CA - Concerned about noise reaching residents. When a container lands on the train will that be controlled by a computer or manually? PeF - A computer will control this movement. The automation should reduce the banging. CA - Can the machine control the speed? PeF – Yes and the height.</p> <p>TB - Is it fair to say there will be less noise after this project? PeF - Yes. This concept reduces the need for breaking etc. It will be a calmer and more managed operation that should have noise benefits.</p> <p>JB - Will trains be running more frequently? Time patterns? PeF – Yes the number of windows will increase.</p>	
---	--

	<p>JB – This is a concern for the residents living adjacent to the trains with more frequency and presumably 24 hour operation.</p> <p>PeF – The number of windows will increase but the intention is to bring in full trains and full trains out. There will be one locomotive per train instead of two or three. They will be quieter trains so we do not expect increased noise impacts.</p>	
3	Accept minutes of last meeting	
3.1	Acceptance of the minutes from May 2019 was moved by MD and seconded by JB.	
4	Actions arising from previous minutes	
4.1	<p><u>Action 3.1 February 2019.</u> Port Authority to forward the consolidated monitoring report to NSW Ports for distribution to the CCC if available prior to the next meeting.</p> <p>Foreshore Beach additional seagrass monitoring IE – Preliminary results of the second (of three) additional seagrass survey, undertaken in May 2019, were encouraging. The dense and healthy Zostera patch at the south-eastern part of the site has almost doubled again in size since the 2018 survey. The report is expected soon and will go on Port Authority website as soon as it is reviewed and finalised.</p>	Remains open
4.2	<p><u>Action 7.1 November 2018.</u> PANSW to present a detailed consolidated summary of the Penhryn Estuary monitoring program at the next meeting.</p> <p>IE – As mentioned at the last meeting, all monitoring associated with the Penrhyn Estuary Habitat Enhancement Program (PEHEP) was completed in early November 2018. All reporting is now online, except for the final shorebird reporting at the End of Project report. Drafts of these two final reports have now been received by Port Authority and are being reviewed. Port Authority will be in a position to report on them to the CCC at the next meeting.</p>	Remains open
4.3	<p><u>Action 3.3 May 2019.</u> EB to take the issue of odours at Millpond during dry weather back to the EPA and discuss the issue with Bayside Council and provide further information to the following meeting.</p> <p>EB - So far discussions have revealed that there is no indication that Dry Weather issues are caused by Sydney Water. Indicates Bayside Council needs to further investigate.</p> <p>JB suggests it a shame Bayside Council not in attendance.</p> <p>BE – Randwick Council did have ongoing regular dry weather issues/overflow 11 years ago. These were reported to Sydney Water at the time.</p> <p>EB – noting the recent successful prosecution of Sydney Water by EPA, the EPA takes overflows very seriously.</p> <p>BE – Noted it might be worth talking to SACL as they undertake water monitoring in the area.</p> <p>EB – Noted difficulties with two regulatory authorities in the space (Council and EPA) however in this instance there is no indication that the EPA has a role.</p> <p>JB – Noted fines in previous cases in the Land and Environment Court</p>	Bayside Council to follow up the issue of dry weather odour.

	<p>were to be set aside for community purposes for reparation works. It was originally said these fines (Sydney Water) would go to consolidated revenue. It is now said Bayside Council will get the bulk based on the court orders. Landcare groups could make good use of the money. He would like to know how the money will be used. Would have been good to see the local community consulted on the uses of money.</p> <p>EB and JB – agreed to chat offline about this concern.</p> <p>CA – Questioned how long odour permeates from council stormwater after it stops raining.</p> <p>EB - Not sure of this. Three weeks after rain would be considered dry weather. It does appear to be a dry weather issue not caused by Sydney Water from issues such as vegetation build up.</p>	
5	Port Botany Community Assets	
5.1	<p>- Update on Foreshore Beach/Penrhyn Estuary</p> <p>IE – General maintenance activities have included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Trimming and mulching older dead trees between Millstream and the Bird Lookout - Increased frequency to fortnightly pressure washing of the boat ramp - Regular cleaning and fortnightly beach grooming. <p>New bins were installed, however needed to be removed due to coating defect. New date for return to be advised.</p> <p>Currently looking into new plantings for the area of Millstream leading into summer.</p>	
6	NSW Ports Sustainability Update	
	- Release of Sustainability Plan	
6.1	<p>TB - NSW Ports will be releasing sustainability plan shortly. A pdf version will be available and some hard copies. Report will come in a more interactive web format. It will be easy to be updated with new stories over time. TB noted NSW Ports thanks to all for their input into plan. Currently in the final stages of getting approvals. NSW Ports will notify the CCC by email when the report is released.</p>	
7	Operational and Development Activities in the Port	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Port Botany Expansion operational update - Tenant Developments – round table - NSW Ports developments inc. road rehabilitation works – GW - Planning and legislation update – GW - Port Botany Expansion operational update 	
7.1	NSW Ports	
	<p>AWH - Noted that the draft conditions for the Port Botany Expansion administrative modification MOD 17 had been received by DPIE. The application should be finalised and approved in the coming weeks.</p> <p>TB – NSW Ports has submitted the Operational Environmental Management Plan for Hayes Dock. The environmental management plan has been submitted for review.</p>	
7.2	Hutchison	
	<p>JS - Noted that Blair Moses has resigned from Hutchison. For the interim JS will attend these meetings. JS advised that Hutchison has commenced work with the EPA and a contractor to remove the sand pile at the end of the Hutchison berth. Noted that Hutchinson is hopeful the sand pile will be removed by the end of this year. Contractual negotiations are currently being carried out.</p> <p>JB asked if a clearance could be obtained from EPA to use the sand to</p>	<p>JS to take on notice and respond whether the sand pile can be used to replenish Foreshore Beach.</p>

	rebuild Foreshore Beach. It would get rid of a problem for Hutchison and the community could get their beach back.	
7.3	<u>Patrick</u> Nil to report	
7.4	<u>DP World</u> Nil to report	
7.5	<u>Vopak</u> AC– Reported that Vopak has received approval to carry out an expansion. Vopak are currently in the process of closing out the tender and getting approvals. The current plan is to build across the road at Qenos old facility. The next step is detailed design and further information will be provided as the project progresses.	
7.6	<u>Elgas</u> Nil to report	
7.7	<u>Caltex</u> Nil to report	
7.8	<u>Origin Energy</u> Nil to report	
7.9	<u>Terminals</u> No representative present.	
7.10	<u>Orora</u> KJ– Reported Orora are finishing construction of engineering warehouse.	
7.11	<u>Qenos</u> Nil to report	
7.12	<u>NSW Ports developments</u> JL – reports that some roadwork is currently underway to resurface the road 100m south of Prince of Wales intersection all the way to Friendship Road and up to Charlotte Road intersection. This work is required as the road surface is at the end of its life. Work includes digging the road 600m down and replacing the surface. Work started last Monday with Ward Civil as the contractor. The work will be carried out in phases – one side of the road at a time. Work is being carried out 24/7 to avoid peak container season before Christmas. Work is due to finish around the end of September. TB - noted that the traffic control starts at Bumborah Point Road. May be some queuing behind traffic control. CA - questioned if the road is cement or asphalt? JL - responded it is asphalt	
8	<u>Port Botany Noise Update</u> - Port Botany Expansion Rail Noise (as per CoA 2.28) TB - noted that NSW Ports have not received any complaints regarding rail noise since the last CCC meeting.	
9	<u>Safety and Environmental Incidents/Complaints</u> - Summary of complaints – TB TB – nil complaints	
10	<u>General Business/Next meeting</u>	
10.1	<u>Potential Cruise Terminal – community campaign</u> LN forwarded for viewing a link to the community campaign. See link below: https://m.youtube.com/watch?v=eQ730BA9R8Y&feature=youtu.be IE – a comprehensive stakeholder and community engagement process to support the next stage of the Cruise capacity project would be delivered once government confirms their timing to progress to	

	<p>consultation. The Port Botany CCC is viewed by the project as a key group for consultation, feedback and input. An overview of the Cruise Capacity project, consultation project, and project timeline would be included as well as one-on-one stakeholder briefings for groups including the Port Botany CCC.</p> <p>JB – Questioned the timing of this?</p> <p>IE – advised this will depend on when the government makes a decision about the project.</p> <p>JB – noted that there has been no consultation to date with the CCC, the community or the local land council.</p> <p>IE – advised that Port Authority is very conscious of that.</p> <p>LH – Questioned if councils and MP's will be kept informed?</p> <p>IE – Yes they will</p>	
10.2	<p><u>Environmental Incentive for Shipping Update</u></p> <p>TB – advised shipping incentive has been running from 1 Jan this year. As at end of June, 260 vehicles had registered for the incentive. This is a significantly higher uptake in the second quarter- more than doubled registrations. Noted that there is a worldwide trend towards ships improving their emissions. The improvement can be attributed to a combination of incentives/legislation.</p>	
10.3	<p><u>NEPM air quality standard</u></p> <p>RR – noted that LN provided a link for submissions to the National Environmental Protection Measure air quality standards. This was distributed to the CCC.</p> <p>EB – noted Submissions close tomorrow. NSW EPA was involved in the proposal that has been put to consultation. Victorian EPA is leading the review.</p> <p>BE – reported Randwick Council will make a submission.</p> <p>JB – reported LN requests a presentation and update to the CCC on NEPM standards. He asked whether there is consolidated data from the various air quality monitors in the area (e.g. former Botany Council, Orica). Someone needs to look at the whole. Something that has been raised over 15 years is the inadequacy of the nearest monitor to this industrial area being at UNSW.</p> <p>EB – noted the air quality monitor looks at ambient air quality not hot spots.</p> <p>BE – noted that the Airport master plan, which has recently been published commits to putting an air quality monitoring station in the airport.</p>	
10.4	<p>CA – Noted for information that Botany Cemetery Trust are looking to expand into Bicentennial Park. Questioned this may have an effect on traffic.</p>	
10.5	<p>TB – questioned if everyone was happy with venue?</p> <p>All present were happy. No issues raised.</p>	
	<p>Next meeting</p> <p>Date: Tuesday 29 October. 5.30pm</p> <p>Prince Henry Centre – McNevin Room</p> <p>2 Coast Hospital Rd, Little Bay NSW 2036</p>	
	<p>RR – This will be Sandra's last meeting. Thank you to Sandra for all of her fantastic work with the group over the years.</p> <p>SS thanks the Chair, NSW Ports, CCC members and particularly community members for the opportunity to work the committee for over ten years.</p>	
	<p>These minutes have been endorsed by the meeting Chair</p>	

	<div>Signed:<div></div></div> <div>Date: 1/9/2019</div>
--	--