

**Meeting:** Port Botany Community Consultative Committee – Meeting No. 23

**Held:** Tuesday 7 May 2019, 5.30pm-7.30pm  
Ground Floor Meeting Room, Brotherson House – NSW Ports

**Present:**

Charles Abela (CA) – Community	Marie Gibbs (MG) – Patrick Stevedores
John Burgess (JB) – Community	Ralf Genutis (RG) – Vopak
Paul Pickering (PP) – Community	Lyndon Reeves (LR) – Elgas Limited
Peter Fagan (PF) – Community	Gary McKay (GM) – Caltex
Marcus Dwyer (MD) – Botany Bay Business Enterprise Centre	Blair Moses (BM) – Hutchison
Patrick Medway (PM) – Bexley Chamber of Commerce	Karen Jones (KJ) – Orora
Bronwyn Englaro (BE) – Randwick Council	Rick Sciarrone (RC) – STA Port Botany Bus Depot
Clare Harley (CH) – Bayside Council	Trevor Brown (TB) – NSW Ports
Ryan Bennett (RB) – Port Authority of NSW	Jonathan Lafforgue (JL) – NSW Ports
Erin Barker (EB) – NSW EPA	Natalia McGregor (NM) – NSW Ports
Roberta Ryan (RR) – Chairperson	Adriane Whiley (AWH) – NSW Ports
Sandra Spate (SS) – Minute taker	Vida Cheeseman (VC) – NSW Ports


**Apologies:** Lynda Newnam – Community, Lachlan McGrath – Electorate Offices for Member for Kingsford Smith, Aldo Costabile – Elgas Limited, Daniel Flannery – ACFS, Jos Kusters (JK) – Caltex, Jamil Kharoudeh – Vopak, Mal Jagdev-Imrich - Community

Item	Description	Action/Responsibility
1	<b>Apologies and Introductions</b> Apologies as listed above.	
2	<b>Accept minutes of last meeting</b> Acceptance of the minutes from February 2019 was moved by PM and seconded by BM. The minutes were accepted.	
3	<b>Actions arising from previous minutes</b>	
3.1	Action 3.1 February 2019. Port Authority to forward the consolidated monitoring report to NSW Ports for distribution to the CCC if available prior to the next meeting. See discussion under agenda item 4.	The action remains open.
3.2	Action 7.1 November 2018. PANSW to present a detailed consolidated summary of the Penhryn Estuary monitoring program at the next meeting. See discussion under agenda item 4.	The action remains open.
3.3	Action 7.2 November 2018. EPA to provide a response to the question of perceived sewerage odours at Millstream outfall and water quality at Foreshore Beach.  EB reported the EPA is aware of regularly poor water quality at the Millstream outfall. This may be due to wet weather overflows from the Malabar sewerage treatment system. Millpond is part of that system. The EPA has a condition on the Sydney Water licence for a study to	EB to take the issue of odours at Millpond during dry weather back to the EPA and discuss the issue with

	<p>better understand overflows and EPA is working with Sydney Water on an abatement program for high priority overflow points.</p> <p>CA and PP noted bad odours in dry weather. CA has rung the EPA hotline but received no response.</p> <p>JB suggested a historical issue which is particularly bad at low tide indicating it is more than a sewerage overflow issue. It may be partly due to a build-up of organic matter in stream and pondage sediments which gives off odours when exposed to sun and air. Odours are present 24/7 in any time other than high tide. He suggested a combination of issues including drains from the airport which also feed into the area. He has previously raised a fish kill issue in the stream near the discharge pipe from the airport fire training area. PFAS has since been raised.</p> <p>EB will take this feedback to the EPA and talk to Bayside Council for a follow up report at the next meeting.</p>	<p>Bayside Council and provide further information to the following meeting.</p>
3.4	<p><u>Action 6.1 February 2019.</u> NSW Ports to email CCC members the presentation on the progress of the Sustainability Plan. CCC members to provide feedback by the end of February.</p> <p>This was done. The action is closed. See discussion under agenda item 5.</p>	
3.5	<p><u>Action 10.1 February 2019.</u> AWe to provide contact details for Catherine Blaine to JB.</p> <p>The action is closed.</p>	
<b>4</b>	<p><b>Port Botany Community Assets</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Update on Foreshore Beach/Penrhyn Estuary monitoring program</li> </ul>	
4.1	<p>RB reported the new boat ramp maintenance contract has been awarded to the incumbent. Steam cleaning no less than monthly at low tide.</p> <p>Ongoing raking of Foreshore Beach is proceeding fortnightly and is removing a large amount of material.</p> <p>Additional seagrass monitoring, which is in its second year, is pending and an update on monitoring results can be provided to the next meeting.</p> <p>Dragonfly, the vegetation management contractor, continues their work including the removal of some dead trees in the near future.</p> <p>Fox baiting continues.</p> <p>Regarding ecological monitoring, all shorebird summary reports are on the website reporting off peak and peak season. The last off peak available is 2018. The last seagrass monitoring summary is on line.</p> <p>Outstanding is the 2017 annual report which is awaiting correction of some administrative errors. The 2018 shorebird annual report is in draft form requiring some revision to include all remaining data. Following this the end of project monitoring report can be finalised hopefully prior to the next meeting.</p>	
<b>5</b>	<p><b>NSW Ports Sustainability Program</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Progress Update on Sustainability Plan – TB</li> </ul>	
5.1	<p>TB reported on progress towards the final draft which will then go for Board approval.</p> <p>A summary of key points included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NSW Ports is committed to reporting on sustainability on an annual basis with more detailed three yearly updates.</li> <li>• A sustainable procurement policy is being developed.</li> <li>• Update of the port risk strategy.</li> <li>• Upgrade of development codes to sustainable development codes for developments on Ports' land.</li> <li>• Energy audits and identification of improvements for energy efficiency.</li> </ul>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continued engagement with government regarding road connections to port.</li> <li>Update economic benefit studies.</li> <li>Investigate the issue of fire-fighting foams at port and options for replacement.</li> <li>Whole of port activity noise monitoring.</li> <li>A whole of port greenhouse emissions inventory to provide a good overall perspective for environmental management.</li> <li>Continuing community sponsorship and grants.</li> <li>Review function of CCCs regularly.</li> <li>A stakeholder perception survey to reach the broader community.</li> <li>A development program for undergraduate work experience.</li> </ul> <p>The aim is to release the Sustainability Plan in the next couple of months.</p>	
5.2	<p>MD asked whether NSW Ports foam contains PFAS and is Ports looking to replace PFAS. Are other types of foam available?</p> <p>TB replied NSW Ports still have stocks of foam containing PFAS. They need foam to be effective particularly at bulk liquid berths but are mindful of environmental considerations. NSW Ports will proceed with expert advice. Foam needs to be effective and able to be used with NSW Ports' equipment.</p> <p>JL reported weekly training events don't use the foam but the foam needs to be able to protect lives.</p> <p>MD asked when a changeover is likely as this is a high priority issue. TB said an update should be available before the end of the year.</p> <p>JB reported on serious health issues affecting trainers at the airport which some people have linked to use of PFAS.</p>	
5.3	<p>CA asked whether NSW Ports has a Disaster Plan and if this is part of the Sustainability Plan.</p> <p>TB replied NSW Ports is looking to upgrade their Emergency Plan. There is a broad piece on risk management in the Sustainability Plan.</p> <p>CA asked if the Sustainability Plan includes a timeframe for the review of the emergency management plan.</p> <p>TB said this will be done in FY2020.</p>	
5.4	<p>PP asked whether NSW Ports has a role in jetties around Botany Bay.</p> <p>JB said RMS and local councils are responsible. Dredging of the port to make it deeper and usable for shipping has created issues with movement of sand at areas including the Brighton/San Souci beach front land locking the existing Dolls Point jetty rendering it unusable, shallowing the entrance to the opening of the Georges River and encroaching on the Ramsar wetlands in the National Park. Sections of mangroves are starting to die as a result of movement of sand and silting up.</p>	
<b>6</b>	<p><b>Operational and Development Activities in the Port</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Port Botany Expansion operational update – MG, BM, TB</li> <li>Tenant Developments – round the table</li> <li>NSW Ports developments – GW</li> <li>Update on Port Botany Cruise Proposal Business Case – CB/RB</li> <li>Planning and legislation update – GW</li> </ul>	
6.1	<p><b>Hutchison</b></p> <p>There are no expansion updates. The sand stockpile is still there. There are no operational changes.</p>	
6.2	<p><b>Patrick</b></p> <p>A draft of the Operational Environmental Management Plan has gone to NSW Ports. It will then go the DPE and then be placed on the website.</p>	
6.3	<p><b>DP World</b></p> <p>No representative in attendance.</p>	

6.4	<b><u>Vopak</u></b> No developments to report.	
6.5	<b><u>Elgas</u></b> No developments to report.	
6.6	<b><u>Caltex</u></b> No developments to report.	
6.7	<b><u>Origin Energy</u></b> No representative present.	
6.8	<b><u>Terminals</u></b> No representative present.	
6.9	<b><u>Orora</u></b> No developments to report.	
6.10	<b><u>NSW Ports developments</u></b> GW reported the Brotherson Dock project is proceeding well.	
6.11	<b><u>Update on Port Botany Cruise Proposal Business Case</u></b> RB said there is no update on that previously given. The Strategic Business Case has been prepared and provided to Government. The next step for government assessment. Pending that assessment, the next step would be for Government to require a Detailed Business Case. PF asked when the Strategic Business case will be available to the community. RB can forward the question. CA understands Pat Farmer, the local candidate, saw the business case and suggested it makes no sense. CA said White Bay can hold two ships but rarely does. Small ships often use the terminal at Circular Quay. If they went to White Bay this would make room for bigger ships at Circular Quay. There has been talk of mooring ships off the beach but they need a vast marshalling area for trucks, food and passengers. This would have to be where the cemetery is now. But the cemetery has a DA in for expansion. JB would love to see the report. He noted there is not universal support for the proposal from the cruise industry with only one operator pushing for it. He doubts Yarra Bay Beach would be used as it is controversial and unworkable. If it goes ahead he would expect it to use parts of the existing port which are not at full capacity. ALP candidates have indicated the proposal won't get past first base. If they come to government federally they will re-examine the Garden Island option. PF tabled two resolutions passed unanimously by Randwick Council on 30 April opposing a passenger cruise terminal at Yarra Bay or Molineux Point. The resolutions foreshadow action by Council to assist the campaign against the terminal and commencement of a process to seek National Heritage Listing for Yarra Bay. PF reiterated that the motions were passed unanimously by Councillors from all groupings (Liberal, Labor, The Greens and Independent). He could not imagine a clearer statement to NSW Ports and PANSW that the Randwick community is united in opposition to a cruise terminal in Yarra Bay (copies of the motions are appended to these minutes). CA reported on information shared at a Council meeting that many Australian Air Force fields are shared by commercial aircraft and there is no reason Garden Island can't also be shared.	
<b>7</b>	<b><u>Port Botany Noise Update</u></b> - Port Botany Expansion Rail Noise (as per CoA 2.28) – TB	
7.1	TB reported there have been no complaints regarding rail since the last meeting. He noted CCC members could also register issues at the meeting.	
7.2	JB asked about timing for the rail duplication. JL replied it is 2021. Planning has started. Two components are the Cabramatta loop and then the duplication.	

	<p>JB hopes current earthworks for access to the airport include enough room for another track at the underpass. MG confirmed it is wide enough for a double track. GW reported the EIS for that project is on exhibition soon and includes the corridor for the bridge.</p>	
<b>8</b>	<p><b>Safety and Environmental Incidents/Complaints</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Biosecurity update – TB</li> <li>- Summary of complaints – TB</li> </ul>	
8.1	<p>TB reported it is brown marmorated stink bug season. NSW Ports is engaged with regulators around the issue to ensure it isn't introduced into Australia. Customers at Enfield are looking at establishing fumigation facilities there. All port facilities are required to finalise bio security management to get declarations. These will go to the Department of Agriculture and Water in coming weeks.</p>	
<b>12</b>	<p><b>General Business/Next meeting :</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Environmental Incentive for Shipping Update - TB</li> <li>- Clean Up Australia Day - NMCG</li> <li>- World Environment Day Tree Planting Event - NMCG</li> <li>- New NSW Ports Corporate Affairs Team - TB</li> </ul>	
12.1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Environmental Incentive for Shipping Update</li> </ul> <p>TB reported over 160 vessels have submitted registration details for shipping incentives. NSW Ports has paid out the first round of rebates. This has attracted additional attention and strong interest. Numbers around reduction in air emissions can be looked at in 12 months' time.</p>	
12.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Clean Up Australia Day</li> </ul> <p>NMCG thanked volunteers who participated. 40 bags of rubbish were collected at Yarra Bay and Molineux Point. 30 volunteers participated.</p>	
12.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- World Environment Day Tree Planting Event</li> </ul> <p>NMCG reported NSW Ports has registered for a team event on 5 June. 10 volunteers have been recruited for tree planting at Sir Joseph Banks. JB suggested bitou bush needs removing first. TB said NSW Ports is actively engaged with Conservation Volunteers Australia and Bayside Council in stripping out bitou bush and other weeds.</p>	
12.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- New NSW Ports Corporate Affairs Team</li> </ul> <p>TB introduced Vida Cheeseman, the new Corporate Affairs lead who has been working on the Sustainability Plan. VC reported on her background prior NSW Ports. Having worked with Asciano she is looking forward to resuming ports related work. The Chair welcomed VC to the CCC.</p>	
	<p><b>Next meeting.</b> The next meeting is Tuesday 6 August, 2019.</p>	
	<p><b>These minutes have been endorsed by the meeting Chair</b></p> <p>Signed:  Date: 27.5.2019</p>	

**NM18/19 Motion Pursuant to Notice - Notice of Motion from Cr Said - Update on  
Opposition to Proposed Passenger Cruise Ship Terminal (F2014/00125)**

**RESOLUTION: (Said/Da Rocha)** considering the recent NSW State Election and the re-election of

This is page 9 of the Minutes of the Ordinary Council held on 30 April 2019

Minutes of ORDINARY COUNCIL

30 APRIL 2019

the Berejiklian Government, Randwick City Council:

1. identify the NSW Minister responsible for Ports and/or the proposed cruise terminal at Yarra Bay or Molineux Point and associated activities;
2. write to the NSW Premier, and the new Minister responsible for ports reiterating Council's strong opposition to a proposed passenger cruise-ship terminal at either Yarra Bay or Molineux Point, highlighting Council's strong concerns about the negative impact a passenger terminal would have on the area including traffic congestion, environmental destruction, loss of open green space and flow-on land-use pressures;
3. invite the Minister to attend a meeting of Council to address these concerns and, if unable to attend, then Councillor representatives arrange a meeting with the Minister;
4. invite representatives from the 'Save Yarra Bay' group, State and Federal MPs, representatives from surrounding councils, members of the Local Aboriginal Land Council and identified concerned residents to a special briefing from council staff on the potential negative impacts of the cruise terminal being located in the LGA; and
5. provide an update to Council on the matters outlined in the previous Council resolution NM63/18 dated 28 August 2018.

**MOTION: (Said/Da Rocha) CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY - SEE RESOLUTION.**



---

**NM19/19 Motion Pursuant to Notice - Notice of Motion from Cr Said - Apply for National Heritage Listing and Grant Program (F2005/00185)**

---

**RESOLUTION: (Said/Da Rocha) that:**

1. based on the comprehensive research collected, Council Officers are to bring back a report on the possibility of applying to the Department of the Environment and Energy to add Yarra Bay and Frenchman's Beach to the National Heritage List (of which Kurnell is already listed); and
2. Council Officers to investigate applying for funds through the, 'Australian Heritage Grant Program' and are to advise Council of the outcome.

**MOTION: (Said/Da Rocha) CARRIED - SEE RESOLUTION.**