

Meeting minutes

Port Botany Neighbourhood Liaison Group

Date: Tuesday 27 November 2012 Time: 5.30pm-7.00pm Meeting No. 19

Location: Sydney Ports Operations Centre – Dampier Room

Attendees

Charles Abela – Community Representative	Neil Truskett – Patrick Stevedores
John Burgess – Community Representative	Ron Brennan – Origin Energy
Lynda Newnam – Community Representative	Aldo Costabile – Elgas Limited
Kellie Parkin – Community Representative	Cliff Bell – Caltex
Oscar Guillen – Randwick City Council	Steve Bates – Vopak
Michael Daley – Member of Parliament for Maroubra	Christa Sams – Sydney Ports Corporation
Greg Sheehy – EPA	Shane Hobday – Sydney Ports Corporation
	Saskia Starr – Sydney Ports Corporation

Guests

James Elks – OEH (Beachwatch)	Adem Long – Sydney Ports Corporation
Rodney Kerr – Sydney Water	Sandra Spate – Minutetaker

Meeting minute taker; Sandra Spate

Meeting Chair: Shane Hobday

Apologies: Nancy Hillier – Community Representative, David Barker – WorkCover, Alison Karwaj – Sydney Ports Corporation, Karen Armstrong – Randwick City Council, Steven Poulton – City of Botany Bay Council, Jacky Wilkes – Rockdale City Council, Stuart Tierney – Customs, John Evic – State Transit Port Botany Depot, Superintendent Karen McCarthy – NSW Police, Nathan Barnes – Vopak

MINUTES

Agenda Items

1. Apologies and introductions

Apologies are noted as above. Attendees were welcomed to meeting number 19. Representatives from OEH (Beachwatch Program) and Sydney Water attended the meeting as guests.

2. Accept minutes of last meeting

Minutes from the previous meeting were accepted and will be placed on the Sydney Ports website.

Meeting minutes

3. Actions arising from previous minutes

Action: Sydney Ports to send Maritime the approval for boat ramp modifications. This was done on August 17. The action is closed.

Action: Sydney Ports to provide the NLG with designs for proposals on Foreshore Beach.

This is discussed under item 6 of the agenda.

Action: Air monitoring results from the Truck Marshalling Area to be provided to the NLG as well as the Cemetery Trust, and be forwarded to the EPA for interpretation. CS reported that monitoring is not yet complete due to the low numbers of trucks using the marshalling yard, an update will be provided at the next meeting.

JB asked why truck numbers using the facility are low.

AL replied that the marshalling area is efficient. Penalties for early arrival have been recently introduced so drivers may be reluctant to arrive too early and use the area.

JB noted the idea of the marshalling yard was to get trucks off the road. If not in the marshalling yard they must be on the road somewhere. He recalls one occasion when there were 320 trailers parked on Foreshore Rd and asks where in Sydney streets have the trucks gone?

AL suggested the marshalling yard is for trucks if there are scheduling issues. Trucks used to spend up to 3 hours waiting to pick up a container and now this is 40 minutes.

JB suggested volumes not escalating as in previous years may also have had an effect.

SH replied trade figures are improving, up 3 to 4% this year from 0.5% growth last year.

AL noted the number of containers handled last month was the highest ever.

LN asked whether Port Botany may be capturing trade from Melbourne as their volume is down.

SH thinks this unlikely.

Action: Sydney Ports to follow up with stevedores the issue of the wind alarm sounding all weekend.

KP and SH noted a recent extended period of strong winds. The Port had shut down but residents had the alarm all weekend - day and night.

NT replied Patrick has a continuous alarm at this point. He will raise the issue with the safety and security personnel.

SH has raised the issue with DP World who reported that each individual crane has an alarm.

The action remains open for follow up by Patrick and DP World.

Action: Follow up to be provided to the NLG from the Major Hazard Facility presentations, by WorkCover and tenants.

AC noted nothing major to report. Elgas submitted 3 reports by the due date with the Safety Report the main report. WorkCover asked for additional information, mainly more detail regarding maps. This was submitted at the end of October and Elgas is waiting on feedback from this. The Safety Report generated an improvement plan and a plan of action for 2013.

RB reported Origin submitted a Safety Report after the presentation and visit to Port Botany by WorkCover on February 22. They were asked for more information on July 26 and lodged the Safety Report at Randwick library in August

Meeting minutes

SB reported that Vopak submitted their reports in February. WorkCover reviewed these and requested further information in September, mainly minor detail around maps. This was provided in October and Vopak is awaiting a response.

CB reported that while the Caltex facility at Port Botany is not a Major Hazard Facility, they have applied the standards of a MHF.

LN asked why the Origin report was lodged at Randwick Library, the closest library being the Botany Library.

RB replied they were asked to lodge it there.

LN raised the need for communication going forward regarding MHFs. She noted discrepancies, with some but not others asked to submit reports to the Randwick library. Under the Act, WorkCover has a responsibility to the community which she suggests has been neglected.

GS replied that WorkCover is working out where to take this next.

SH noted that JF has left WorkCover. A WorkCover representative familiar with MHFs will continue to attend NLG meetings.

Action: Sydney Ports to provide the climate change assessment to LN.

CS has provided LN with the Executive Summary which is the public component.

LN suggested threats regarding connecting roads and rail are not covered, nor storm surges.

SH replied the report looked at the port operations area and movement of vessels in and out of the port.

CS replied the risk assessment is 5 years old. Additional work has been done since.

Action: Sydney Ports to follow up a reported rude response from Harbour Control to a complaint.

SH advised that the issue was raised with the appropriate manager. There has been a reminder to all staff to be courteous at all times and to record information and pass on for investigation.

4. Water Quality at Foreshore Beach

LN suggested that according to the last Beachwatch report, Foreshore Beach was the worst in Sydney. She compared to artists impressions with swimmers prepared for the Ports expansion to the existing beach.

Following an email from LN, OEH and Sydney Water were invited by Sydney Ports to the NLG meeting to provide presentations on this subject.

Presentation by Beachwatch

JE delivered a presentation on recent Beachwatch findings (attached to the minutes).

The rating for Foreshore Beach has dropped from poor to very poor since the last report. The biggest source of potential pollutants is sewage overflows. Stormwater is another source. It was suggested the main reason was that 2011 was a wet year with more sewage overflows with impacts seen across Sydney.

Around 70% of the time the Foreshore Beach site is assessed as suitable for swimming.

Beachwatch predictions for each day are posted on their website, Facebook and via Twitter. He suggested that people choose to swim as advised by the Beachwatch website.

LN asked whether, given the demographic of the area, this could be taken seriously. She

Meeting minutes

questioned whether people will look on the website before they walk on the beach and possibly wade in the water.

JE responded that Beachwatch gets some calls to their hotline. Advice is predicated on people swallowing 50mL of water. Beachwatch is trying to get information out through as many channels as possible.

LN suggested the issue is that Foreshore Beach is the only beach residents of the Botany municipality have and there is no plan of management to get something done to address problems. There needs to be a first step taken towards a solution.

JB thought discussion over the years indicated that people are not encouraged to swim at Foreshore Beach, which is not a good outcome. More people are now coming here and the sand has disappeared. It needs to be worked out how to preserve the beach and then address problems regarding movement of water in the area leading to a build up of contamination. Sydney Ports may have indirectly discouraged people from using the beach. JB personally would not go in the water there. Residents used to have a beach all the way to the airport, now have a small stretch between the drains.

LN suggested that for residents of Banksmeadow, Foreshore Beach is the only beach they have.

MD asked if it is safe to swim at Maroubra, can it be assumed it is safe to swim at Foreshore Beach.

JE replied that this is generally the case, but Foreshore Beach takes longer to flush after rain, about 4 to 5 days compared to a day for coastal beaches.

JB suggested a major problem with the lakes overflow is the flow into drains and flooding into the Foreshore Beach area. Added to this is the sewerage overflow at Millpond Creek. RK noted with coastal beaches there is good flushing of sewerage and stormwater. With estuarine tidal areas flushing is not as good, estimated at around 3 days. Non tidal rivers don't flush at all; in addition the saltwater kills the bugs.

Note: for further queries, JE contact details are: ph 9995 5466; email James.Elks@environment.nsw.gov.au.

Presentation by Sydney Water

RK delivered a presentation (attached to the minutes) on the stormwater and sewerage overflow systems in relation to Foreshore Beach.

24,000 kilometres of sewerage is owned by Sydney Water and 24,000 kilometres is privately owned. In heavy downpours stormwater flows into the system.

The sewerage network consists of branches going into the trunk. When the trunk can't cope, sewage overflows to the stormwater system to prevent it flowing back to into houses.

The Malabar system starts at Campbelltown, goes through Liverpool, Homebush and connects near Cooks River and goes on to Malabar. The Sydney Water target is for Malabar not to overflow more than 40 times in 10 years. The overflow affecting Foreshore Beach is not frequent, but it has high volumes. A lot of the overflow is from the inner west which has old sewerage and stormwater systems. The plumbing code stipulates that stormwater not be connected to the sewer but there are issues for work done 40-50 years ago. There is no systematic maintenance of the private sewer system. Tree roots into pipes allow infiltration. Around 30% of stormwater infiltrates sewers with the biggest contributor water percolating through soil.

Meeting minutes

KP asked about the Bondi system.

RK replied this is a separate system from Malabar. It goes from Balmain to Bondi, but the Malabar system is the largest in Sydney. The area overflows to Millpond which carries a lot of stormwater. The chain of ponds scours the stormwater, but it is a big overflow which is impounded compared to stormwater at Congwong.

KP asked whether sewage flowed to Congwong.

RK replied it doesn't.

RK reported on what Sydney Water is doing. Overflows are down to 15% of 2002 levels after capacity was increased through cleaning silt from the sewer. From here there are very costly solutions to further remedy the problem (such as the large tunnel from Lane Cove to Manly) which Sydney Water doesn't have plans for in the short term.

KP asked whether the problem will get worse with population growth. Will the increased volume of water use be a factor?

RK anticipates that this will work in Sydney Water's favour with the renewal of pipes as a result of development. He expects the problem to improve over the longer term, but Sydney Water needs to look at shorter term solutions. Growth is not a big factor. Urban renewal will improve things over the long term.

LN asked how water quality here is linked to water quality in the Cooks River. She noted groups campaigning for improvement of water quality and a beach on the river for swimming. A tunnel could benefit more than just Foreshore Beach.

RK noted decreased water volume in Cooks River over the years. Whenever it rains stormwater displaces the water in the river. In moderate storm events Cooks River is filled with stormwater. Cooks River campaigners could possibly generate local amenity some other way, for example, creating a beach off line.

LN noted a lot of information has been given in the presentation. However we are not moving forward with commitments regarding Foreshore Beach during the Port Botany Expansion. The artist's impression was that we will have a nice beach with swimming. SH notes that Sydney Ports can't control the sewage issue, however there are plans for the stabilisation of the beach.

LN asked whether more education is required. Should there be more forthright signage? SH replied Sydney Ports are using standard signage.

5. Update on NSW Government refinancing of Port Botany

SH reported NSW Treasury has gone to the market for bidders for a 99 year lease Port Botany, Port Kembla, the Cooks River Terminal and the Enfield Intermodal Terminal. The EOJ process for bidders closed at the end of October. Some of these have now been selected to submit indicative bids by mid December which would then go to a final firm bid stage. Treasury aims to complete the process by approximately May next year.

LN asked how many bidders and who are they?

SH replied that Sydney Ports does not have that information. Bidders can offer for Port Botany and Port Kembla together or separately and there is some discretion regarding inclusion of Cooks River and Enfield. The Bill was passed by the NSW Upper House on

Meeting minutes

Wednesday night.

A media release from the Treasurer was distributed to the meeting.

LN suggested her understanding of the Bill didn't seem to suggest the discretion around inclusion of Cooks River and Enfield and wondered whether content of the Bill is subject to change.

MD raised issues from discussion reported in the minutes of the previous meeting. SH had suggested he could see no reason why the public couldn't continue to access Prince of Wales Drive and Molineaux Point lookout. MD suggested there are no guarantees of what sort of access and is concerned that with removal of the cap on TEUs, forecasts for container movements and the target of 28% for movement by rail, and that the new owner will want to use the road at Molineaux Point for truck queuing.

SS and SH suggested that the configuration of Molineaux Point would pose difficulties for truck access.

MD suggested this wouldn't be impossible to fix.

Action: Sydney Ports (SH) to confirm whether it is the intention to include ongoing public access to Molineaux Point in the lease, and to convey to Treasury that the NLG requests guarantees that trucks be restricted from access to Molineaux Point.

In relation to a comment by RT indicating that strategic reports by Infrastructure NSW on state priorities and Transport for NSW on long term freight and port strategy were expected in November as well as public reports regarding the amount of traffic using roads, CA asked whether any of these reports are publicly available. He is interested in the capacity of the roads.

SH added that a major Environmental Report on the Port will be provided to bidders. LN reported difficulties in getting any information. She has written letters without getting a satisfactory response.

Action: Sydney Ports to follow up the availability of strategic reports relevant to the Port from Infrastructure NSW and Transport for NSW, including reports on transport and traffic volumes.

Post-meeting follow up: The links to the key NSW government reports are as follows:

<http://www.transport.nsw.gov.au/content/draft-nsw-freight-and-ports-strategy>

<http://www.infrastructure.nsw.gov.au/state-infrastructure-strategy.aspx>

6. Development Activities in the Port

Sydney Ports developments

Port Botany Expansion

SH reported that the Banksia St overpass is complete and Sydney Ports is negotiating the handover with Botany Council.

The grade separation opened on November 19 with work on signage continuing.

SICTL have started work on their site on Terminal 3. Patrick's are due to start works early next year.

LN asked about saltmarsh removal as part of the SICTL works.

CS reported this was to facilitate drainage without causing sand erosion. There was

Meeting minutes

approval from the Department of Primary Industries (Fisheries) to create a channel. SICTL has transplanted 100% of the saltmarsh to other areas of estuary.

LN asked whether this means the area dedicated to saltmarsh is reduced.

Action: Sydney Ports (CS) to respond to the issue of the overall size of saltmarsh area.

SH reported that the relocation of the southern pontoon at the boat ramp was completed on September 21 to give four lanes between pontoons. There has been good feedback from boat users. Discussions are being held with the Department of Primary Industries (Fisheries) for a fishing platform potentially at the start of the estuary.

LN asked whether this is a healthy area for fishing.

JB replied it is similar to other areas of the Bay.

KP asked whether there is monitoring of fish from the Bay.

JB reported that there is little monitoring.

Foreshore Beach

SH reported significant erosion of Foreshore Beach since completion of the Port Botany Expansion project. Detailed investigations have been undertaken around stabilisation works. The preliminary plan is for up to three rock groynes. Discussions are being held with Sydney Water. Stormwater pipes are blocking, possibly aggravating flooding in the Council area. The proposal involves about \$3 million of works, with Sydney Water as a co-contributor to this.

A diagram indicating potential sites for groynes was tabled at the meeting.

CS reported that a physical model will be created to help determine the number of groynes.

LN asked whether people will be able to walk on them. She requested that Sydney Ports do something nice with the groynes as they have done with other works such as the lookout. There may be a possibility for fishing.

JB noted that this will take pressure off the wetlands, but when it rains contaminants from the wetlands will discharge at Foreshore Beach. He is glad to see works being undertaken and suggests it will work, but as Botany's only beach it will reduce the beach area and discharge contamination. There is poor water reticulation here harbouring contamination. His reservations are that the problem has been known for eons, but this is a bandaid solution. Sydney Water has never been keen to be involved and money is not available for an ultimate solution.

SH responded that Sydney Ports was looking at a long term solution. They hope this will solve the problem of stability of the beach.

LN noted people won't be able to walk the whole length of the beach.

SH noted a drift of sand to the Millstream groyne. As a temporary measure Sydney Ports will move 4,700 cubic metres of sand and relocate it along the beach. The northern end of the beach will be closed for this but the Millstream lookout will remain open. Access to sand at southern end of the beach will remain. An ad will be placed in the Southern Courier next week. This will also be emailed to NLG members.

Action: Copy of notice regarding Foreshore Beach sand relocation works to be emailed to community members.

JB raised concerns regarding the proposed dredging by Caltex at Kurnell as to where the sand will be relocated. It will be dumped at sea off Sydney Harbour and fishermen are not happy about this. He would like to look at using the sand to restore beaches, but contaminants have been found in one spot (TBT – an anti fouling chemical). There is no

Meeting minutes

regulation around what to do with this. This will be the first time in 70 years that sand has been dumped near Sydney Heads.

BLB2

The berth is expected to be completed in January with users then starting to install equipment and the first ship scheduled for mid 2013. The project has been constructed by John Holland.

Truck Marshalling Area

SS reported numbers of 150 trucks a day initially rising to between 160 and 170 in September but dropping back to 150 now. The 170 coincided with BBQs on site. Peak hours are between 7am and 7pm, with half the number on weekends.

KP asked about the capacity of the area.

SS and SH replied that there is capacity for 52 B-Doubles at any one time.

KP asked whether there has been further feedback from the Cemetery Trust.

CS replied they have been invited to the NLG meetings and will be provided with monitoring results.

Action: Sydney Ports to provide monitoring results.

Other developments

SH reported Sydney Ports is constructing a new dish drain (called a swale) below the escarpment from the former Bunnerong Power Station to improve drainage through the site.

An application is being prepared for regrading of the seabed using a 'sweep bar' in Brotherson Dock to eliminate a number of high spots.

KP asked how often areas are surveyed.

SH replied this area of Brotherson Dock is surveyed six monthly with two yearly surveys in other areas.

LN asked where the choke sites are and what limits these place on the size of ships.

SH replied these are in the channel and are 15.6 metres.

LN suggests larger vessels, such as 18 metres wouldn't be able to use the Port. SH suggested the current depths would be adequate for the 8,000 TEU container ships.

Sydney Ports development assessments and approvals

CS reported Sydney Ports is still considering approval for Terminals to relocate their weighbridge, and Terminals has approval for a new office.

Patrick's has approval to install two new quay cranes.

Vopak's bitumen facility associated construction carpark were approved in October.

SH noted that the majority of bitumen coming into NSW will come across the Bulk Liquids Berth.

CA asked whether it will be deodorised.

SH and SB replied that a filtering system burns off vapours. During import vapours go through a combustor unit.

JB asked about the process for maintaining temperature.

SB replied that it runs through heat coils to maintain a temperature of about 180 degrees.

Update on Tenant developments

RB reported the installation of new Raptor Radar gauges for tanks at Origin Energy, with

Meeting minutes

high level alarms. Origin conducted emergency exercises in October. 10 years no lost time injury has been achieved.

AC reported a milestone for Elgas on October 3 when they clicked up 4,000 days no lost time injury. The last lost time injury was in 2001.

CB reported four emergency exercises recently undertaken by Caltex went well.

SB reported that Vopak has moved into the new administration building with the car park now clear for parking.

7. Update on noise issues

SS noted the ongoing process of replacing reversing alarms with squawkers. Sydney Ports is investigating with the rail team the alarm at the rail bridge. Sydney Ports will continue to address noise issues and she asked for continuing help in identifying problems.

SH noted that as an issue is addressed, Ports will identify the next source. Qube has now converted their forklifts to squawkers.

LN noted the progress that has been made and asked that measures continue to be publicised, such as with the article in the Southern Courier today.

SH reported a meeting is scheduled for later this week with the Mayor and Councillors of Randwick Council to discuss noise issues.

8. Safety and Environmental Incidents and Emergency Exercises

There have been a total of 24 incident reports since the last meeting. Seven were from the community, five being noise complaints. The other two community complaints were in relation to air or water pollution. There were 8 further water pollution reports (all minor) and 4 odour complaints from adjacent port operators. Two reports were in relation to container leaks. There were three other incidents including a vehicle and trailer going into the water at the Boat Ramp, a fire alarm and an overturned truck on the new grade separation.

KP reported an issue raised at the Precinct meeting of confusion around the need to call different numbers: Sydney Ports, AMCOR, EPA, or Botany Industrial Park. People calling at 2.00am have the additional stress of trying to identify the source. They want it to be easy, know who to call for the whole picture.

CS suggested if people can identify the source as from the port, call Sydney Ports but if not call the EPA. Complaints made to the Sydney Ports Harbour Control will be referred to the source if the port isn't the source. Sydney Ports declare noise complaints received to the NLG.

LN suggested it is the cumulative picture that hits community.

GS said the EPA is happy to take the calls.

9. Other Matters/next meeting

SH reported approaches from two community members for NLG membership (names supplied).

The NLG encouraged Sydney Ports to pursue membership for both these candidates.

Action: Sydney Ports to contact nominees to confirm interest.

Meeting minutes

LN asked about the continuation of NLG meetings in future.

SH replied that the NLG will continue to meet going forward. There is an ongoing commitment to continue with the NLG, and with the Port Botany Expansion Community Consultative Committee until construction is complete.

LN asked when Hutchison will attend the NLG.

CS replied this would be when they are operational.

SH thanked NLG members for their attendance throughout the year and for their feedback which is passed on within Sydney Ports. He wished everyone well for Christmas and the New Year.

Date of next meeting: Tuesday 26 February 2013

These minutes have been endorsed by the meeting Chair

Signed

Date

Attachments: Beachwatch and Sydney Water Presentations