

Meeting: Port Botany Community Consultative Committee – Meeting No. 13

Held: Tuesday 22 November 2016, 5.30pm-7.00pm
SICTL Training Room, 1 Sirius Road Botany

Present:

| | |
|--|--|
| John Burgess (JB) – Community | Marie Gibbs (MG) – Patricks Stevedores |
| Mal Jagdev-Imrich (MJI) – Community | Karen Jones (KJ) – Orora |
| Bronwyn Englaro (BE) – Randwick Council | Michael Martin (MM) – Vopak |
| Mitch Donohue (MD) – Electorate Offices for Member for Kingsford Smith | Aldo Costabile (AC) – Elgas Limited |
| James Goodwin (JG) – EPA representative | Gary McKay (GM) – Caltex |
| Laura Anstead (LA) – EPA representative | Mark Walker (MW) – Qenos |
| Marcus Dwyer (MD) – Botany Bay Business Enterprise Centre | Blair Moses (BM) – SICTL Stevedores |
| Matthew Wright (MWh) – Botany LAC | Daniela Vujic (DV) – NSW Ports |
| Shane Halliday (SH) – Botany LAC | Trevor Brown (TB) – NSW Ports |
| Paul Britt (PB) – Port Authority of NSW | Jonathan Lafforgue (JL) – NSW Ports |
| Roberta Ryan (RR) – Chairperson | Phil Jones (PJ) – Terminals Pty Ltd |
| Sandra Spate (SS) – Minute taker | |

Apologies: Lynda Newnam – Community, Adem Long – NSW Ports, Andrew Battye – SafeWork NSW, Jos Kusters – Caltex, Charles Abela – Community, Steve Poulton – Bayside Council, Catherine McMahon – Bayside Council, Ryan Bennett – Port Authority of NSW, Lisa Williams – Electorate Offices for Member for Maroubra, Luke Frawley – DP World

| Item | Description | Action/Responsibility |
|------|---|--|
| 1 | Apologies and Introductions Apologies are as above. The Chair welcomed attendees who then introduced themselves. | |
| 2 | Accept minutes of last meeting Acceptance of the minutes from the August meeting was moved by GM and seconded by AC. The minutes were accepted. | |
| 3 | Actions arising from previous minutes | |
| 3.1 | Action 3.2 from August 2016. RR to follow up with Brad Milner, PAoNSW the request to consider the extension of seagrass monitoring in light of the groyne construction. RR has received a response from the Port Authority of NSW which has been circulated and will be attached to the minutes. | |
| 3.2 | Action 3.8 from August 2016. RR to follow up on organising a meeting with the Commissioner for the Central District and invite interested parties. RR has spoken to a chain of people to invite a representative from the Greater Sydney Commission to talk to CCC members. The response has been no. The Chair wishes to register her disappointment with this response. The Greater Sydney Commission is holding a series of consultation meetings and people are invited to attend these. BE asked whether RR has tried Maria. | RR to circulate to CCC members the website link for the Greater Sydney Commission consultation events. |


| | | |
|----------|--|---|
| | <p>RR replied she had, as well as the Social Commissioner and the Economic Commissioner. The Chair offered that CCC members would be willing to meet the Commission at any time. Their response was that they were very busy and the answer was no.</p> <p>The website link is for community consultation is http://www.greater.sydney/get-involved</p> | |
| 3.3 | <p>Action 5.3 from August 2016. AW to speak to ACFS regarding the possibility of sending a representative to CCC meetings.</p> <p>TB understands they have been invited and he will follow this up.</p> | <p>TB will follow up with ACFS the invitation to attend meetings.</p> |
| 3.4 | <p>Action 6.1 from August 2016. NSW Ports to advise the CCC when the PBE modification application is on public exhibition.</p> <p>This has been done. The action is closed.</p> | |
| 4 | <p>Port Botany community assets</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Updates on Foreshore Beach groynes design and project – RB | |
| 4.1 | <p>PB reported work on groynes is progressing well with the expected date for completion in mid-December. Rock work is being finished and sheet piling is finished. Remaining work involves moving sand to the eastern side of the beach followed by the clean-up.</p> <p>While JB was unable to see the groyne work on the way to the meeting due to traffic gridlock, he noted concerns raised by himself and LN around designs and sheet pile construction. They wanted more amenity around groynes, for them to be more usable for the community. Also, we still haven't got an answer regarding seagrass monitoring which is disappointing given that work on the groynes and the stormwater pipes is a result of the Port Botany extension. Seagrass was to be restored and it hasn't been. He had hoped for a positive outcome. He feels the monitoring needs to continue for another three years..</p> <p>PB reported he is happy to say an additional seagrass survey undertaken in September showed an increase in growth. The results from the survey are on the Port Authority website. Cardno were instructed to undertake the survey after a storm flattened a sand bun. There will be another survey after completion of works next month which will also go on the website.</p> <p>PB reported a potential issue for boaties is that the groyne piles are a currently all black. Fluoro sleeves will go over the piles, with one lit and one unlit as per current boating requirements. The pile in between will have a cap from one to the other then to shore.</p> <p>JB asked how this would blend with the landscape. He understands the safety issues, but what is left for this community is an eyesore. There is nothing left of the beach which is now cut up with three groynes and we have fluoro sleeves on the piles. As a member of the community he is less than impressed. It could have been done better. The issue highlights the community's dealings with Ports and RMS over 15 years and their failure to get things right.</p> <p>RR requests JB notify her when he has had a chance to look at the result.</p> <p>PB reported sand is being brought to the eastern side to make a useable beach and there will be pathways over the groynes. Over time nature will take over and the sand will settle into an equilibrium.</p> <p>JB asked whether the sand is from the SICTL stockpile.</p> <p>PB replied it isn't. Sand for the eastern end is from the original beach east of the Millstream lookout.</p> | |

| | | |
|----------|--|--|
| | <p>JB noted this sand is not from the original beach but from sand which has been dumped there from far and wide over many years to stabilise and restore the beach which has on several occasions been badly eroded (almost to Foreshore Rd) due to a combination of wave energy and storm water discharge. The existing is far from the original beach and what has happened with wave action is exactly what he had initially predicted would happen.</p> | |
| 5 | <p>Development activities in the Port</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - NSW Ports developments – DV - Tenant developments | |
| 5.1 | <p><u>NSW Ports developments</u></p> <p>DV reported on two developments. The first is for Modification to the Port Botany Expansion development approval, Modification No. 16, which has been on public exhibition. Exhibition is now closed. NSW Ports is working through submissions before going back to the Department of Planning with a response. No major issues were raised by the community or agencies.</p> <p>The other development is maintenance dredging works at Brotherson Dock. This is currently occurring and involves redistributing sediment material with a sweep bar that levels out the higher spots on the seabed. Work should be complete by Christmas.</p> | |
| 5.2 | <p><u>SICTL</u></p> <p>BM reported no new developments. They await approval from the EPA for removal of the stockpile.</p> | |
| 5.3 | <p><u>Patrick</u></p> <p>There are no developments at Patrick.</p> | |
| 5.4 | <p><u>Elgas</u></p> <p>There are no developments at Elgas.</p> | |
| 5.5 | <p><u>Vopak</u></p> <p>MM reported draft Conditions of Consent have been issued for the B4 expansion project. These are on exhibition for seven days.</p> <p>Vopak has been working through a review of the Modification to the existing site which should be sent to the Department of Planning in the next five days. It will then go on exhibition.</p> | |
| 5.6 | <p><u>Caltex</u></p> <p>There are no developments to report.</p> | |
| 5.7 | <p><u>Orora</u></p> <p>KJ reported approval has been received for a secondary water treatment plant on site and preliminary civil works have commenced. The plant is expected to be commissioned in September next year. It will be for biological treatment to clean up water and provide better quality water to the waste system.</p> | |
| 5.8 | <p><u>Terminals</u></p> <p>PJ reported demolition is still being undertaken and is expected to take some time.</p> | |
| 5.9 | <p><u>Qenos</u></p> <p>There are no developments.</p> | |
| 6 | <p>Port Botany Noise Update</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Update on Liaison with the Greater Sydney Commission – RR - Port Botany Expansion Rail Noise (as per CoA 2.28) – TB | |
| 6.1 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Update on Liaison with the Greater Sydney Commission <p>This was discussed under agenda item 3.2.</p> | |
| 6.2 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Port Botany Expansion Rail Noise (as per CoA 2.28) <p>TB reported the only complaint received in the last quarter was a</p> | |

| | | |
|----------|---|--|
| | complaint from a resident of Myrtle Street about rail noise regarding wheel squealing from the freight line. Thforwarded complainant was advised to contact ARTC. | |
| 7 | Safety and Environmental Incidents/Complaints <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Port traffic and safety – WA - Biosecurity update – TB - Summary of complaints – TB | |
| 7.1 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Port traffic and safety – <p>JB raised the issue of the Orica’s secondary containment line barriers on Foreshore Road. The temporary barriers are being replaced with permanent concrete ones. There had been an intention by NSW Ports to extend the right hand turning lane from Foreshore Road into Penrhyn Road which is not long enough. Discussions took place with NSW Ports, Orica, Council and RMS two years ago. The intention was to extend the right hand turn lane by 200 metres into the area of the median strip where Orica has their safety barrier. Trucks now wishing to make a right hand turn into Penrhyn Rd during peak traffic periods have no choice but to queue back beyond the turning lane thereby blocking the right hand lane and restricting traffic flow along Foreshore Rd to only one lane – the left hand lane. Trucks are now making dangerous turns into the left lane forcing ordinary vehicles off the road onto the dirt verge of Foreshore Rd.</p> <p>The containment lines arose from the necessity to avoid a health disaster by capturing the flow of groundwater and pumping it back for treatment. The pumps will be there for 50 to 100 years. But the reality is that traffic here is a disaster and needs a far better traffic plan. There had been a suggestion that Foreshore Road would go from four to six lanes. There were suggestions the containment line could go along golf course side of the road but there are fuel and power line issues. This is a problem which needs to be resolved now to avoid greater difficulties later.</p> <p>TB understand JB’s concerns as he has encountered the same problems. He suggests the issue is not necessarily for this group but is perhaps for RMS, Orica, EPA and Council.</p> <p>JB said Shane Hobday had a working group to try and address the issue but it seems to have gone nowhere since his retirement. RMS seems unwilling.</p> <p>MWh asked who owns road.</p> <p>JB said ownership seemed to move as responsibility for an issue arises. It had been owned by the Port Authority and managed by RMS. He confirmed that it had been clarified two years ago that it was an RMS matter.</p> <p>MWh suggested there may be more involvement from Council after the amalgamations. He will raise the issue with the relevant people.</p> <p>JB noted B-doubles pull straight into traffic and push cars over to the left hand lane.</p> | Add to the agenda for next meeting the issue of right hand turning trucks from Foreshore Road into Penrhyn Road. |
| 7.2 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Biosecurity update <p>TB isn’t aware of any biosecurity incidents. Department of Primary Industries has completed their response on fire ants and the issue is finalised. NSW Ports received a thank you letter from them.</p> <p>Activity on the policy front is in regards the Ballast Water Convention for shipping due to take effect in September next year. The Federal government is working towards putting in regulatory processes to regulate ballast water for international and domestic vessels. There was a marine pests working group meeting last week.</p> | |
| 7.3 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Summary of complaints <p>The only complaint was the rail noise complaint described at Item 6.2</p> | |

| | | |
|-----|--|--|
| | above. | |
| 7.4 | <p>Constable Matt Wright introduced himself and Inspector Shane Halliday to the meeting. With a change in commanders there has been a change in local emergency controllers. They are responsible for incidents. Karen McCarthy has moved on and Superintendent Leanne McCusker has taken over the Rockdale and Botany Bay Council areas.</p> <p>JB reported that Karen McCarthy, who used to attend meetings, was given the responsibility for developing an emergency plan for the area. It is a difficult task with many issues. There have been a number of close calls which were fortunately averted due to the actions of individuals. But he fears one day the ducks will line up and a disaster will occur at peak hour when emergency vehicles can't get in or an evacuation will be difficult.</p> <p>MG suggested there are other similar places across Sydney.</p> <p>JB said this is a huge complex with containers, vessels and petroleum fuel. There was a major gas leak in the past and a container ship which came adrift in the port during bad weather almost collided with a fuel bunker ship at the base of Brotherson Dock. Caltex has flooded its terminal with fuel as a result of a faulty valve with a disaster averted due to the brave actions of an individual who received a Safety Award.</p> <p>MW suggested the area is unique. The new position of Botany Bay Emergency Management Officer is unique to Botany Bay. The position looks at queries around emergency management. MW is the point of contact. His contact details are included below.</p> <p>Constable Matt Wright, Emergency Management Officer, Botany Bay Local Area Command, Mobile: 0436 010 628, Ph. 8338-7399/Fx. 8338-7411, WRIG4MAT@police.nsw.gov.au</p> <p>MJI said there is no evacuation plan for Matraville. In an emergency, she like most people wouldn't know where to go.</p> <p>JB said there is also an issue of how to notify people if a decision is made that the risk of a potential disaster is significant enough.</p> <p>MG noted social network is used in bushfires but this needs to be coordinated. She can foresee issues getting emergency services in and out in traffic congestions.</p> <p>MJI, JB and MG suggested different means of communication for different demographics such as social media, radio, networks like Neighbourhood Watch.</p> <p>MW noted procedures are in place for the airport but not Port Botany which is problematic as there are few evacuation centres. They are trying to address this. Text messages do work but people need to be registered.</p> <p>RR noted tenants have their own procedures. The CCC is happy to assist.</p> | |
| 8 | <p>General Business/Next meeting :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Advertisement for new PB CCC members – TB - Draft district plans - Guidelines for CCC | |
| 8.1 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Draft district plans <p>TB reported the Greater Sydney Commission has released draft plans. Port Botany is in the Central District. The Port is recognised as a key strategic centre in the plan. Priorities include identifying and protecting industrial zoned land protecting Port Botany as port infrastructure. There is an aim to increase the proportion of freight by rail and investigate enhanced road links to WestConnex. Unfortunately specific actions regarding the Port are softer than priority</p> | |

| | | |
|-----|--|--|
| | <p>statements around encroachment of development. The last two sustainability items are updating guidelines around planning for rail and road corridors and another for air and noise impacts associated with key industrial centres.</p> <p>JG reports EPA has been in ongoing discussion with the Greater Sydney Commission and it is good to see some results. LA has done considerable work on this.</p> <p>TB appreciates that there have been positive steps with the GSC.</p> <p>RR noted the draft plans are now up for consultation. There is now an opportunity to respond to concrete proposals. She encouraged people to make submissions and take up consultation opportunities.</p> <p>District Plans are significant planning instruments with stronger statutory importance. RR is happy to talk to people about this. Issues around WestConnex may be something to consider. She encourages people to comment.</p> | |
| 8.2 | <p>RR reported new Community Consultative Committee guidelines from the Department of Planning have been released. While this CCC has operated over a long period and has been largely aligned with the guidelines there are a couple of changes. She was appointed as Chair by the Minister. Now the Secretary of the Department appoints the Chair who is now more influential than in the past. The Chair has responsibility for the minutes, appointing members and writing to the Secretary on proposed appointments which should broadly cover interests of the community. The Chair also has the authority to remove people. The Chair makes an annual report on behalf of CCC to the Secretary regarding the operation of the CCC. Independent note taking is being encouraged and there is a one month turn around on the minutes. The minutes go to RR, then to Port to sure technical details are accurate, then to members and back to the Chair for finalisation before going on to the website which is required within a month.</p> <p>Pecuniary Interests Declarations and Code of Conduct declarations have been distributed to community members and hard copies are available. Community members must declare any actual or perceived pecuniary interests with Port. These go to the Department and are not made public. It is declared in the minutes each time that the Chair is paid to conduct meetings.</p> <p>In the past RR has done a ring around as part of the evaluation of how meetings have gone over the past year. She proposes to do this in February to inform the report to the Secretary. She is happy to bring in Chairs from other committees to assist with this to ensure people are able to offer opinions freely.</p> <p>The link to the new guidelines is http://www.planning.nsw.gov.au/CommunityConsultativeCommittees</p> | |
| 8.3 | <p>- Advertisement for new PB CCC members</p> <p>NSW Ports has had one applicant in response to advertisement for new CCC members. The gentleman is a police officer who lives in Botany and has applied as a local resident. He lives close to the rail line so may be a good addition to gauge perceptions about rail noise.</p> <p>TB has also approached business groups. He introduced MD as a representative from Botany Bay Business Enterprise Centre as an observer to tonight's meeting.</p> <p>TB has also approached the Matraville Chamber of Commerce and will approach the precinct committee and the Maroubra Chamber of Commerce.</p> <p>BE can suggest several people for TB to follow up.</p> | |

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| 8.4 | TB reported the International Maritime Organisation met earlier this year and committed to reducing the fuel sulphur limit from 3.5 to 0.5% by 2020. TB said the international approach is positive. This will cover main engines and auxiliary engines for all ships at sea or in port. | |
| | The Chair thanked members for their attendance over the year. The next meeting is 28 February 2017. | |
| <p>These minutes have been endorsed by the meeting Chair</p> <p>Signed:  _____</p> <p>Date: 10/12/2016</p> | | |



4 November 2016

Roberta Ryan
Chair
Port Botany Community Consultative Committee

Dear Roberta,

Request for extension of seagrass monitoring at Foreshore Beach

Thank you for your letter requesting that the Port Authority of New South Wales (Port Authority) considers a request to extend the seagrass monitoring at Foreshore Beach beyond the five year program under the Penrhyn Estuary Habitat Enhancement Plan (PEHEP).

The overall aim of the erosion protection works currently underway at Foreshore Beach is to install groynes along the beach that will reduce the north-west and offshore movement of sediment, implementing a design that will provide a hydrological environment that should allow for the recovery of the seagrass along Foreshore Beach. The groynes will also serve to protect Foreshore Beach from on-going beach erosion.

As the formal ecological monitoring requirements under the PEHEP near completion, the Port Authority will be evaluating any potential further monitoring. This will include due consideration for further monitoring of seagrass at Foreshore Beach following the completion of construction of the groynes and following the last scheduled seagrass monitoring as part of the PEHEP, which is scheduled to occur in March 2017. The Port Authority will continue to engage with the Port Botany Community Consultative Committee regarding potential further seagrass monitoring at Foreshore Beach beyond March 2017.

If you have any questions, please contact Ryan Bennett, Senior Planning & Sustainability Manager on 9296 4674.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Brad Milner".

Brad Milner
Acting EGM Commercial, Technical & Legal

SYDNEY

ABN: 50 825 884 846

www.portauthoritynsw.com.au

YAMBA

PO Box 143
Yamba NSW 2464
T: 61 2 6646 2002

NEWCASTLE

PO Box 663
Newcastle NSW 2300
T: 61 2 4985 8222

SYDNEY

PO Box 25
Millers Point NSW 2000
T: 61 2 9296 4999

PORT KEMBLA

PO Box 89
Port Kembla NSW 2505
T: 61 2 4275 0100

EDEN

PO Box 137
Eden NSW 2551
T: 61 2 66461596